



## Planning Board Minutes

Monday, January 24, 2022

6:00 PM

(Work Session at 5:30pm)

Common Council Chambers

41 City Hall Place

Plattsburgh, NY 12901

### Pledge of Allegiance

**Roll Call:** James A. Abdallah (Chair), Rick Perry, Reg Carter, Curt Gervich Loretta Rietsema (Alternate)

**Staff Present:** Shelise Marbut (Planning Assistant), Barbara Brister (Senior Clerk)

**Excused:** N/A

\*\*\*\*\*

### A. Monthly Project Review

#### 1. PB# 2021-13, 127 Court Street Historic Site Review {TABLED}

**Project Description:** Request to apply vinyl siding to a historic building in the Court Street Historic District. Zoned RH; Tax Map Parcel ID #207.18-5-16

**Applicant:** Hilzack Properties, LLC

**Plan Preparer:** Hilzack Properties, LLC

- Applicant in attendance via Zoom. Applicant has no new information to present;

#### A. Motion to remove application 2021-13 from the table.

Moved By: Rick Perry

Seconded By: Curt Gervich

Roll Call: Rick Perry, Reg Carter, Curt Gervich, Loretta Rietsema (All in the affirmative)

#### B. Motion made by to reject current application and encourage applicant to return w/ application considering ordinance, SOI guidelines, Historic Preservation, SHPO.

Moved By: Curt Gervich

Seconded by: Reg Carter

Discussion:

- Board discussed the 62-day decision period falls on the February 28<sup>th</sup>, the next planning Board meeting date;
- The board discussed the unknown use history of the building/transition from potential single family use to multi-family use; Mr. Gervich stated use is a distraction from the matter at hand and the use is not a consideration in historic preservation. Mr. Gervich further stated that the use remains residential and the board does not know with certainty whether the original use was as a single-family home or multi-family home;
- Mr. Gervich questioned why other board members were not considering the two alternatives (wood and fiber cement) noted by SHPO as appropriate alternatives and were considering either only vinyl siding or no action. Ms. Rietsema stated her main consideration was that the appropriate alternatives were cost-prohibitive. Mr. Gervich stated that cost is not a consideration under historic review guidelines and is problematic, subjective, and would be difficult to enforce unilaterally on future applications.
- Mr. Perry and Ms. Rietsema questions what carried more importance: preservation of historic features and materials, or possible demise of the structure due to no action. Ms. Rietsema stated that occupant safety must be considered. Mr. Gervich again questioned why not consider the appropriate alternatives outlined by SHPO;
- Mr. Abdallah requested a plan detailing how architectural materials would be protected if vinyl was installed.
- The board engaged in a lengthy review/discussion of general Historic Site Review Standards and the board's role in interpreting the standards. Mr. Perry commented that the Building Inventory Form is a representation of the property at the time it was nominated in the 1970s and the board is unclear on what materials existed during its original construction and what they should be trying to protect. Mr. Perry further commented that the board does not have a history of modifications made to the building.
- Mr. Abdallah requested a history of past board decisions on similar applications for vinyl siding and a history of the permit and board approvals of the example properties within the historic district represented in Mr. Latinville's application as having vinyl siding. Mr. Latinville objected to this request and stated he would not do research and that the source of such information should be obtained by city. Staff consented to performing research as requested.
- Mr. Latinville objected to the motion and questioned why a new application would be necessary.

**ACTION TAKEN:** Adopted  Defeated  Withdrawn  Tabled

- C. Motion made to table until next meeting, requesting the applicant to amend the application in consideration of the zoning ordinance, the guidance from SHPO, and the guidelines with the Secretary of the Interior's publication; and for the applicant to coordinate with staff to provide history of relevant previous applications/vinyl repairs to homes in the Historic District as well as the examples noted within the initial application.

Moved By: Curt Gervich                      Seconded By: Reg Carter  
 Roll Call:      Affirmative: Curt Gervich, Reg Carter, Jim Abdallah  
                     Negative: Rick Perry, Loretta Rietsema

**ACTION TAKEN:**    Adopted     Defeated     Withdrawn     Tabled

**2. PB# 22-01, Arizona Avenue Self Storage Units**

**Project Description:** Request to construct six (6) self-storage structures totaling 32,000 sq. ft. and related site improvements. Located at the corner of Arizona Avenue and So. Peru Street; Area and Use variances achieved; Zoned R2; Tax Map Parcel ID #233.6-1-6.2

**Applicant:** WJB Properties, LLC

**Plan Preparer:** Aaron Ovios, RMS, PC

**Project Representative:** Thomas M. Murnane, Esq.

- A. Motion to adopt sketch plan concept resolution 22-01 noting that 3<sup>rd</sup> party review of stormwater pollution prevention plan is required.

Moved By: Rick Perry                      Seconded By: Curt Gervich

Roll Call: Rick Perry, Reg Carter, Curt Gervich, Loretta Rietsema, Jim Abdallah  
 (All in the affirmative)

Discussion:

- Thomas Murnane, Esp. said he is aware that the plans have to go to the County Planning Board Mr. Murnane said the County Planning Board has seen the plans before.
- Mr. Murnane said that he will provide additional lighting detail.
- The units will be an earth-tone color.
- There have been some confusion in the past as to whether the property is an industrial zone or an R2 zone. It was determined to be an R2 zone which required the filing of a Use Variance application. Approval was given by the Zoning Board of Appeals.
- Applicant’s responses to staff comments and board members questions included:
  - There are no overhead lights;
  - Access to site is via Arizona Avenue only;
  - Plans for storm water will be provided in detailed plan submission;
  - All payments/transactions will be handled online (no business office on site);
  - There will be 24hr access to storage units;
  - Security camera on site;
  - Electrical power to two units for business-use only, not for clients;

- Vehicular traffic is accessible to tractor trailer/moving van;
- DPW will retain access to fire hydrant in center of site;
- Gravel area behind buildings can be used for boat/car/RV storage;
- Hazardous material restrictions will be added to rental contracts;
- Existing block building on site is a water meter building;
- Distance from northern corner of property to residences is approximately 60' to 70' and existing forested area will remain and serve as buffer to residential area.

**ACTION TAKEN:** Adopted  Defeated  Withdrawn  Tabled

## B. Other Business

A. Update on Board Member Search – Interviews will be set soon.

B. Recommendations for Historic Site Review process

Discussion topics included;

- Board members are not confident in what their roles/responsibilities are in the Historic Site Review process;
- Need for enhanced review guidelines;
- Research guidelines in other communities for possible template/adoption;
- Necessity of possibly holding a public hearing to determine community interest in Historic Preservation

## C. Adjournment

James A. Abdallah, Chairperson

## Resolution No.: 22-01

Motion by: Rick Perry

WHEREAS, the City Planning Board has received and reviewed a Sketch Plan Application, Sketch Plan, and supplemental materials for:

**ARIZONA AVENUE SELF STORAGE UNITS SITE PLAN:** Request to construct six (6) self-storage structures totaling 32,000 sq. ft. and related site improvements. Located at the corner of Arizona Avenue and So. Peru Street; Area and Use variances achieved; Zoned R2; Tax Map Parcel ID #233.6-1-6.2 Owner/Applicant: WJB Properties, LLC; Architect/Engineer: Aaron Ovios, RMS, P.C.; Project Representative: Thomas M. Murnane, Esq.

### **SKETCH PLAN REVIEW** and;

WHEREAS, the City of Plattsburgh's Community Development Department has conducted a sketch site plan review of the "Project" and has submitted a completed checklist for detailed preliminary plans dated January 21, 2022 as part of the City of Plattsburgh *Zoning Ordinance* Section 360-34 Site Plan Review Procedures for the City Planning Board to review and consider; and

WHEREAS, the City of Plattsburgh Code, Section 360-56 requires a public hearing and notice shall be posted within 5 calendar days of the meeting; and

WHEREAS, NYS General Municipal Law Section 239m is applicable and the plans submitted for this project will be referred to the Clinton County Planning Board for review and consideration; and

WHEREAS, Part 617 of the Environmental Conservation Law - "State Environmental Quality Review Act" (SEQRA), provides for the review of any "ACTION" to determine the effect of the action on the environment, along with any related administrative procedures for the implementation, authorization or approval of the action; now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the City of Plattsburgh Planning Board after a review of the said application, sketch plan, EAF and recommended checklist items does hereby determine that the proposed project is as checked below:

- An action involving a Federal Agency - A final EIS for the action has been duly prepared under the National Environmental Policy Act of 1969 and a findings statement pursuant to NYS Environmental Law Part 617.11 will be prepared by the Town's Planning Board.

- Type I Action a coordinated review will be conducted and the City of Plattsburgh Planning Board shall request to be designated lead Agency;
- Type II Action - no further environmental review is necessary;
- Unlisted Action:
  - A coordinated review will not be done
  - A coordinated review will be done and the City of Plattsburgh Planning Board shall request to be designated lead agency
  - A coordinated review will be done and the City of Plattsburgh Planning Board does hereby designate \_\_\_\_\_ to assume the lead agency role in accordance with the New York State Environmental Law; and be it further

RESOLVED, that upon receipt of a complete Detailed Preliminary Plan Application for the above referenced project the Community Development Office shall schedule a public hearing and such hearing shall be posted at least five calendar days prior to the meeting; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the City of Plattsburgh's Planning Board after a review of the site plan and the Community Development Department's Staff Report dated January 21, 2022 does hereby:

- A. Receive and place on file the site plan checklist and staff report completed by the City's Community Development Department dated January 21, 2022; and
- B. Concur and accept the findings and recommendations contained therein; and
- C. Require that the applicant have his licensed land surveyor and/or professional engineer submit three (3) full-sized paper copies, seven (7) reduced-size paper copies and one (1) digital copy of a **Detailed Preliminary Site Map and Plan** in accordance with the checklist items as recommended by the City's Community Development Department and as shown on the checklist.
- D. Require that the applicant submit **ALL REQUIRED PERMITS, APPLICATIONS, DRAWINGS AND ALL OTHER MATERIALS** as indicated on the said checklist.

RESOLVED, that the said Detailed Preliminary map, plans and related materials as listed above shall be submitted to the City Community Development Office three (3) weeks prior

to the Planning Board Meeting at which time the above said map, plan and related materials are to be considered.

Seconded By: Curt Gervich

**Discussion (Not Verbatim):**

- Applicant’s responses to staff comments and board members questions included:
  - There are no overhead lights;
  - Access to site is via Arizona Avenue only;
  - Plans for storm water will be provided in detailed plan submission;
  - All payments/transactions will be handled online (no business office on site);
  - There will be 24hr access to storage units;
  - Security camera on site;
  - Electrical power to two units for business-use only, not for clients;
  - Vehicular traffic is accessible to tractor trailer/moving van;
  - DPW will retain access to fire hydrant in center of site;
  - Gravel area behind buildings can be used for boat/car/RV storage;
  - Hazardous material restrictions will be added to rental contracts;
  - Existing block building on site is a water meter building;
  - Distance from northern corner of property to residences is approximately 60’ to 70’ and existing forested area will remain and serve as buffer to residential area.
  
- This project shall require third party professional review of the stormwater pollution prevention plan (SWPPP).

	<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Roll Call:			
James Abdallah	X		
Rick Perry	X		
Reg Carter	X		
Curt Gervich	X		
Loretta Rietsema	X		

Carried: 5-0-0